

## **SOUTH CAROLINA COMMISSION ON HIGHER EDUCATION**

Meeting held at  
1122 Lady Street, Suite 300  
Columbia, S.C. 29201  
12:00 p.m.

### ***Minutes of the Meeting*** **June 6, 2019**

#### **Commissioners Attending**

Mr. Wes Hayes, Chair  
Mr. Chuck Munns, Vice Chair  
Mr. Paul Batson\*  
Mr. Jim Battle  
Ms. Julie Godshall Brown\*

Mr. Charles Dalton  
Mr. Edgar Dyer  
Mr. Devron Edwards\*  
Dr. Bettie Rose Horne  
Mr. Ben Satcher

Ms. Terrye Seckinger  
Dr. Cleveland Sellers  
Mr. Patrick White

#### **Commissioners Absent**

Ms. Linda Dolny (excused)  
Dr. Mark Smith (excused)

#### **Guests Attending**

Mr. Robert Barsanti, The Citadel  
Dr. Mark Bebensee, The Citadel  
Ms. Beth Bell, Clemson University  
Mr. Benjamin Blanks, Francis Marion University  
(FMU)  
Mr. James Colbert, Lander University  
Mr. Cardon Crawford, The Citadel  
Dr. Tena Crews, University of South Carolina  
Mr. Ralph Davis, FMU\*  
Mr. John Dorian, The Citadel  
Mr. Tim Drueke, Winthrop University  
Mr. Dan Ennis, Coastal Carolina University  
Mr. Jimmy Foster, College of Charleston  
Mr. David Frost, Coastal Carolina University  
Ms. Catherine Gutshall, University of South Carolina  
Mr. Scott Heller, Scientific Research Corp.  
Mr. Joerg Hemberger, Mercedes Benz Corp.  
Mr. Mark Hollingsworth, University of South  
Carolina Aiken (USCA)  
Ms. Tara Horner, The Citadel

Dr. Andrew Hsu, College of Charleston  
Mr. Brent Jonas, Charleston Regional Alliance  
Dr. Peter King, FMU  
Mr. John Kispert, FMU\*  
Ms. Allison Dean Love, The Citadel  
Dr. Brian McGee, College of Charleston  
Dr. Steve Osborne, College of Charleston  
Mr. Craig Parks, University of South Carolina  
Mr. Paul Patrick, College of Charleston  
Mr. Fred Price, The Citadel  
Mr. George Ramsey, Charleston Metro Chamber of  
Commerce  
Ms. Allison Steadman, FMU  
Ms. Taylor Trantham, Volvo Corp.  
Ms. Gitta Unger, Bosch Corp.  
Mr. Sebastian Vandelden, College of Charleston  
Gen. Glen Walters, The Citadel  
Dr. Fran Welch, College of Charleston  
Dr. Ron Welch, The Citadel

\*Attended by phone

#### **Commission Staff Present**

Mr. Mike LeFever  
Ms. Kanesha Adams  
Dr. Jennifer Almeda  
Dr. Argentini Anderson  
Ms. Laura Belcher  
Dr. Sandra Carr  
Ms. Lane Goodwin  
Dr. Samuel Grubbs  
Ms. DeVaris Hatten

Dr. John Lane  
Ms. Yolanda Myers  
Mr. Andrew Roof  
Mr. Georges Tippens  
Ms. Leslie Williams  
Mr. Bryce Wilson  
Dr. Karen Woodfaulk  
Dr. Lishu Yin

Chair Hayes convened the meeting at 12:05 p.m. and welcomed all in attendance. It was confirmed that the meeting was being held in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act.

## **1. Introductions**

Ms. Belcher introduced the guests in attendance. A motion was made by Commission Horne at 12:08 p.m. to enter executive session for the purpose of discussing legal and personnel matters. The motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Battle, carried unanimously.

## **2. Approval of Minutes**

**Wes Hayes**

At 12:35 p.m., the Commission returned to its public business meeting. Chair Hayes then called for a motion to approve the minutes of the Commission's May 2<sup>nd</sup>, 15<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> meetings. Vice Chair Munns motioned and Commissioner Satcher seconded to approve the minutes as presented. The motion passed unanimously.

## **3. Chairman's Report**

**Wes Hayes**

Chair Hayes thanked Commissioner Dalton and other members of the Search Committee for their good work in conducting the search and hiring process. He recounted the Commission's meeting the previous Friday, May 31, when the Commission voted unanimously to invite Dr. Rusty Monhollon to serve as the agency's new president and executive director. He announced that Dr. Monhollon had accepted the invitation and would take up his post Monday, July 15.

Second, Chair Hayes thanked the Legislature and Governor for what he estimated to be an outstanding budget for the upcoming fiscal year.

## **4. & 5. Interim President and Executive Director's and Legislative Reports**

**Mike LeFever**

Interim President and Executive Director Mike LeFever informed the Commission that the agency celebrated the week of May 6th employee appreciation week, during which small events were held to thank employees for their service and provide a platform to recognize employees for special accomplishments. He particularly recognized Dr. John Lane, who has logged five years of service to the state; Ms. Lisa Collins and Ms. Leslie Williams, both also serving five years; and Ms. Lorinda Copeland, who has served state government for 30 years. Mr. LeFever then introduced Ms. Kanesha Barnes, a Southern Education Foundation Initiative Fellow who he stated will be at CHE for the next few weeks to work on the College Access Initiative.

Mr. LeFever continued with his report, announcing that the agency recently completed a project two-years in-the-making to migrate its servers to the state's Division of Technology Operations (DTO). He explained that the migration would reduce costs while simultaneously improving security. He thanked Ms. Monica Goodwin and the rest of the agency's IT team for their efforts in realizing the migration.

Mr. LeFever updated the Commission on the progress made by the office relocation team, which had recently submitted the relocation forms to the Department of Administration to inform their drafting of an RFP (request for proposals). He reminded the Commission that the move would occur in June 2020.

Mr. LeFever stated that Ms. Anika Ali, Ms. Laura Belcher, Mr. Georges Tippens, and Mr. Bryce Wilson had been collaborating to update the agency's Form 100, which he stated was necessary for the agency to certify that institutions' tuition and fees accorded with the Tuition Mitigation Fund's stipulations, as outlined by Proviso

117.155 of the 2019-2020 Appropriations Act. He added that the agency must complete such certifications and have them reported to the state budget office by October 1, 2019.

Mr. LeFever informed the Commission that Mr. Bryce Wilson and Mr. Tony Brown had been drafting a response to the Fiscal Year 2018-2019 agency audit conducted by the State Auditor's Office. He assured Commissioners that he would share the response with them once it is finalized. With only several minor findings, mostly related to the agency's nascent relationships with the Department of Administration, Mr. LeFever estimated the agency to be in solid shape.

Lastly, Mr. LeFever reviewed the CHE Priorities Report, which describes the activities undertaken by the agency during the preceding month to advance each of the agency's five priorities: College Readiness, College Planning & Affordability, Educational Attainment, Economic & Workforce Development, and Teacher Advocacy.

Mr. LeFever transitioned to the Legislative Report.

He informed the Commission that the Legislature had vacated Columbia for the summer, and he expected it to remain adjourned until January 2020 when session is scheduled to resume. He stated the Governor had vetoed several minor components of the FY 2019-2020 budget, whose highlights he proceeded to overview.

Mr. LeFever called Commissioners' attention to a spreadsheet they were provided which listed and described the budget provisos pertaining to CHE. He noted the agency's operating budget for the upcoming fiscal year amounted to approximately \$45.6 million, which he explained covered 43 total FTEs, merit-based scholarship funding, SREB programs, and the PASCAL library.

Mr. LeFever again described the Tuition Mitigation Fund and the criteria institutions must satisfy to qualify for its monies. Furthermore, he discussed the Capital Reserve Bill, a fund of roughly \$119 million purposed with aiding colleges and universities in renovations and repairs.

Mr. LeFever stated that a joint resolution, H.3697, permitting students impacted by the closure of Education Corporation of America (ECA) schools to be exempt from the requirements of Regulation 62-6(D), would be introduced during the next legislative year.

Mr. LeFever announced that the sunset clause in the Tucker Hipps Transparency Act had been removed, thereby making it an enduring law.

Mr. LeFever shared that regulatory updates to the Palmetto Fellow Scholarship had passed, consequently allowing students to qualify for the scholarship at any time during the year and to take a gap year with impunity.

Lastly, Mr. LeFever very briefly discussed bills pertaining to higher education that would be a focus in the coming legislative year: S.283, the Higher Education Enterprise Act, which remained in the Senate for second reading; H.4453, the State Institution of Higher Education Efficiency Act; S.298, the Higher Education Opportunity Act, which also remained in the Senate for second reading; H.4576, similar to S.298, that was introduced by Representative White; and S.419, the omnibus education bill, which remained within the Senate Education Committee.

His last report to the Commission, Mr. LeFever concluded on a bright note, stating that CHE was well poised for a cooperative and productive future.

## **6. Committee Reports**

## 6.01 Report of the Executive Committee

Wes Hayes

The Committee had no report.

## 6.02 Report of Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing

Terrye Seckinger

### CONSENT AGENDA

#### A. SmartState® Operating Budget, Revised FY 2019-20 and Proposed FY 2020-21

#### B. Program Proposals

1. The Citadel, B.S., Computer Engineering
2. The Citadel, M.S., Instructional Systems Design and Performance Improvement
3. Coastal Carolina University, B.S., Applied Statistics
4. Coastal Carolina University, B.S., Public Health
5. College of Charleston, B.S., Systems Engineering
6. Francis Marion University, B.S., Biology, Pre-Professional Studies Option
7. University of South Carolina Aiken, B.A., Chemistry
8. University of South Carolina Aiken, B.A., Communication & Digital Arts
9. University of South Carolina Aiken, B.A., Music
10. University of South Carolina Aiken, B.F.A.
11. University of South Carolina Beaufort, B.S., Information Science and Technology
12. University of South Carolina Beaufort, M.Ed., Literacy
13. University of South Carolina Columbia, D.N.P., Nurse Anesthesia
14. University of South Carolina Upstate, B.A., Community Health

#### C. Miller-Motte Technical College

#### D. Annual Evaluation of Associate Degree Programs

1. FY-15
2. FY-16
3. FY-17

**Program Approval Rate, Cycle Two, ending March 7, 2019: 65%**

Commissioner Seckinger briefly overviewed the items proposed by the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing for the Commission's approval. Before approval, Dr. John Lane, director of the division, added that item 6.02.B.10. University of South Carolina Aiken, B.F.A had been updated since publishing as a consequence of a crosswalk at the federal level concerning degree designations and CIP codes. Commissioner Seckinger thanked staff for their efforts in processing the substantial number of items listed under the consent agenda. Chair Hayes called for questions or debate. Hearing none, the consent agenda, which was brought forward as a motion from the committee and therefore did not require a second, passed unanimously.

#### E. For Consideration: College of Charleston, B.S., Electrical Engineering

Next, Commissioner Seckinger introduced the College of Charleston's proposed Bachelor of Science degree in electrical engineering, which was being brought before the Commission for consideration. Before opening the floor to deliberation, she recognized publicly that the program had generated a bit of controversy, and Vice Chair Munns added that it was at his request that the program was removed from the consent agenda and asked for the opportunity to give a minority report to the Commission.

Interim Provost Dr. Frances Welch and former Provost Dr. Brian McGee, both representing the College of Charleston, advocated for the approval of the institution's proposed B.S. in electrical engineering. They circulated a presentation handout to each of the Commissioners to aid their case. They explained their primary justifications for the program's approval included its ability to more effectively supplement industry and workforce demands and its potential to recruit and produce greater numbers of female engineers. Dr. McGee

added that the potential for a partnership between the College of Charleston and the Citadel had been explored, but discussions between the two highlighted the incompatibility of their aims and the absence of a meaningful overlap between the schools' students. The College of Charleston's newly installed president, Dr. Andrew Hsu, appealed to the Commissioners' sense of responsibility to the state of South Carolina.

Dr. Welch then called for industry representatives attending the meeting in support of the proposed program to introduce themselves.

After the Commission heard the College of Charleston's points, Commissioner Seckinger called for The Citadel to provide its perspective. General Walters, president of The Citadel, agreed that more engineers—specifically electrical engineers—are needed and that the state's workforce and industry needs should be a priority; however, he and the institution he represented disagreed with the College of Charleston about how to effect better outcomes in these areas. Citing the success, potential, and national recognition of The Citadel's already-established electrical engineering program, Gen. Walters stated that a partnership between the Citadel and the College of Charleston would be the best way forward and cautioned about the duplication of programs. He added that The Citadel's engineering programs had capacity that, through partnership, could be filled by College of Charleston students.

Commissioner Dyer, referring to the College of Charleston's handout, which stated that a joint and dual program with The Citadel was not feasible, asked if a partnership was impeded by either the Accreditation Board for Engineering and Technology (ABET) or the Southern Association of Colleges (SACS). Dr. McGee answered that the College of Charleston's ongoing concern was that recruiting prospective students would be more difficult if the ultimate degree would be awarded by an entirely different institution, and he invited the dean of The Citadel School of Engineering, Dr. Ronald Welch, to clarify the ABET issue. Dean Welch explained that joint programs—that is, programs at two separate schools—must be identical or else the accreditation process becomes far too complicated. Instead, from his professional experience, he has witnessed more success with 2+2 and 3+2 programs.

President Hsu agreed that joint programs, as well as 2+2 programs, were infeasible, the latter especially between four-year institutions. He also noted that College of Charleston's students preferred attending and graduating from one four-year school, thus rebutting Gen. Walter's claim that The Citadel's open seats could be filled through a partnership between the schools.

Chair Hayes announced that some Commissioners had questions.

Rhetorically, Commissioner Battle asked how many students the College of Charleston had turned away because it lacks an electrical engineering program. Raising his belief that the Commission's interests laid with protecting South Carolina's entire higher education system, not individual schools, he cautioned against taking risks on costly programs that might not produce a substantial enough return. He subsequently asked if the demand for electrical engineers is great enough to warrant the creation of an additional program, which he feared might be duplicative.

After Commissioner Battle voiced these points, Commissioner Seckinger proposed to Chair Hayes that she be given the floor to present CAAL's majority report, followed by Vice Chair Munns with the minority report. Chair Hayes consented to this proposal.

Commissioner Seckinger began with her understanding that the Commission is responsible for managing the state's marketplace of higher education, with individual institutions responsible for their own. Specifically describing the marketplace for electrical engineering programs, she noted available capacity at the University of South Carolina Columbia, whose provost attended the most recent CAAL meeting and expressed concerns that a realized electrical engineering program at the College of Charleston may capture some of their students.

Additionally, she reiterated, The Citadel has capacity in both its electrical engineering programs. Her and other CAAL members' ultimate concern with approving the College of Charleston's proposal for an electrical engineering program was the cost incurred from duplication within the same marketplace, especially against the backdrop of under-capacity programs nearby.

Ceding the floor to Vice Chair Munns, Commissioner Seckinger noted that CAAL's vote on the program was split 3-to-2 in favor of denying the program.

Vice Chair Munns agreed with Commissioner Seckinger that the Commission is responsible for managing the state's higher education system but should not be restrictive of its ability to fulfill workforce needs. He asked what the state's most important workforce need is, and answered that it is engineers—including electrical engineers. Recounting his experiences in the Navy and as the administrator of the Savannah River Site, he highlighted the demand for electrical engineers and the insufficient supply of those produced in-state. He therefore concluded that the program being considered would be efficient and productive and expressed confidence in its design. He urged his fellow Commissioners to heed the attending industry representatives' advocacy for the approval of the College of Charleston's proposed program. Ultimately, he stated, the state's workforce needs supersede program duplication.

Before receding the floor, Vice Chair Munns recounted the proposed program's recommended approval by the Advisory Committee on Academic Programs (ACAP) and CHE staff. He unequivocally advocated its approval, too.

Commissioner Seckinger added that two of nineteen members at the last meeting of ACAP—the University of South Carolina and The Citadel—voted against the program's approval, an event which she described as rare. Commissioner Seckinger asked Dr. Lane to vouch for the rarity of no votes at ACAP meetings, and Commissioner Horne added a request for Dr. Lane to subsequently explain the program vetting process. Dr. Lane addressed Commissioner Horne's question first, explaining that the program approval process, from its origination at the proposing school through the Commission, is quite rigorous. Subsequently, he informed the Commission that nineteen ACAP members were present at its most recent meeting at the end of March, with seventeen voting in favor of the program's approval and two against.

Commissioner Horne, addressing the points raised earlier by Commissioner Battle, stated that student satisfaction was an important byproduct of their institution's mission to meet the needs of the state.

Vice Chair Munns relayed Commissioner Dolny's support for the program to the Commission, as she was unable to attend the meeting either in-person or by phone.

Commissioner Battle cautioned that, yes, while creation of an additional program may lead to increases in the overall number of electrical engineers, it could very well precipitate conditions which weaken both programs.

Commissioner White and Commissioner Brown expressed their skepticism of the need for another electrical engineering program.

Commissioner Edwards commended the College of Charleston for its diligence in crafting its proposed program but thought it unnecessary at this time.

After all opinions had been expressed, Commissioner Seckinger motioned to deny the program; however, before the motion could be seconded, Vice Chair Munns asked the Committee to consider a substitute motion to approve the College of Charleston's proposed electrical engineering program. He reasoned the substitute motion would eliminate the possibility of a second vote that would result from the failure of Commissioner Seckinger's original motion. Commissioner Horne seconded the substitute motion put forward by Vice Chair Munns.

Commissioner Battle motioned, and Commissioner Dyer seconded, for a rollcall vote.  
 Votes to approve the College of Charleston's B.S. in electrical engineering are recorded below.

<b>Vote Results</b>			
<i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Aye</i>	<i>Nay</i>	<i>Absent</i>
Mr. Paul Batson			
Mr. James Battle			
Ms. Julie Brown			
Mr. Charles Dalton			
Ms. Linda Dolny			
Mr. Edgar Dyer			
Mr. Devron Edwards			
Mr. Wes Hayes			
Dr. Bettie Rose Horne			
Vice Admiral Charles Munns			
Mr. Ben Satcher, Jr.			
Ms. Terrye Seckinger			
Dr. Cleveland Sellers			
Dr. Mark Smith			
Mr. Patrick White			

With the failure of Vice Chair Munns' substitution motion in a vote of 7-to-6, Chair Hayes called for the original motion or for someone to move to take the previous vote. Commissioner Battle motioned, and Commissioner Horne seconded, to take the previous vote. The motion to deny the proposed electrical engineering program from the College of Charleston was carried unanimously.

**F. Annual Report on the National Council for State Authorization Reciprocity Agreements (NC-SARA) and South Carolina Activities**

*(For Information, No Action Required)*

**G. Report on Program Modifications, January 24-May 8, 2019**

*(For Information, No Action Required)*

Commissioner Seckinger presented the items for information purposes only.

**6.03 Report of Committee on Access & Equity and Student Services**

**Paul Batson**

The Committee had no report.

**6.04 Report of Committee on Finance and Facilities**

**Charles Dalton**

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**A. Review of Revised Facilities Manual**

**B. Permanent Improvement Project Approvals**

1. The Citadel

- A. Supplemental Housing
  - Establish Phase I

2. Coastal Carolina University

- A. Academic Enrichment Center and Auditorium Land Donation
  - Establish Phase II Land Acquisition Budget

3. College of Charleston
    - A. Simons Center for the Arts Renovation – Phase II
      - Establish Phase II Construction Budget, Change Source of Funds
  4. Francis Marion University
    - A. Preliminary Land Acquisition for future Ecology Center
      - Establish Phase I/Phase II
    - B. FMU Honors Learning Center Construction
      - Increase Phase II Budget
  5. Tri-County Technical College
    - A. Pendleton Campus Fulp Hall Renovation - Predesign
      - Establish Phase I
  6. USC Aiken
    - A. USC Aiken Penland HVAC Renovation
      - Establish Phase II Construction Budget, Change Source of Funds, Revise Scope
  7. USC Columbia
    - A. Intramural Recreation Fields Preliminary Land Acquisition
      - Establish Phase I
    - B. Taylor House Maintenance Renovation
      - Establish Phase I
    - C. Thornwell College Maintenance Renovation
      - Establish Phase I
    - D. Jones PSC Biology Labs Renovation I
      - Establish Phase II Construction Budget
    - E. Williams Brice Stadium Renovations
      - Establish Phase II Construction Budget
  8. Winthrop University
    - A. Byrnes Roof Fire Restoration
      - Establish Phase I
- C. Lease Approval**
1. Medical University of South Carolina
    - A. 1786 Anthony Street
      - 10-year Lease Renewal

Commissioner Dalton discussed the purposes, costs, and funding sources of the thirteen proposed capital projects, as well as informed the Commission of the Committee's revised facilities manual. The consent agenda, which was brought forward as a motion from the committee and therefore did not require a second, passed unanimously.

Commissioner Dalton asked Mr. Georges Tippens to inform the Commission of a conditional motion, which was made by Commissioner Dolny and ultimately approved by the Committee on Finance and Facilities at its meeting earlier, that pertained to item 6.04.B.7.E University of South Carolina Columbia - Williams Brice Stadium Renovations. Mr. Tippens read the motion aloud:

*Observing that USC Columbia will be nearing its statutory debt limit of \$200 million after issuance of \$21 million in athletic revenue bonds, the Committee on Finance & Facilities unanimously recommended approval of the project as presented. The Finance & Facilities Committee was informed that USC currently plans no other issuances of debt, allowing USC to have greater available debt capacity by the end of the year 2024 due to the scheduled retirement of debt.*

Commissioner Seckinger asked if the restriction was self-imposed. Invited to answer by Chair Hayes, Mr. Craig Parks answered that the restriction was statutorily instituted.

**B. List of Capital Projects and Leases Processed by Staff for April 2019**

*(For Information, No Action Required)*

Commissioner Dalton presented the item for information purposes only.

**6.05 Report of the Search Committee for the next President & Executive Director**

**Charles Dalton**

**A. Approval of Minutes of May 23<sup>rd</sup> Meeting**

Commissioner Dalton extended his thanks to the members of the Search Committee for their diligence in finding and hiring a new, permanent president and executive director. The minutes of the last Search Committee meeting held on May 23, 2019, which were brought forward as a motion from the committee and therefore did not require a second, passed unanimously.

**7. Other Business**

**A. Update on the South Carolina Higher Education Foundation**

Commissioner Satcher informed the Commission that the Foundation approved at its previous meeting on May 15, 2019, a request for funds in the amount of \$9,500 from the Cherokee County Know2 Initiative. He assured the Commission that Cherokee County Know2 would provide updates on how the funds are being spent.

Additionally, he announced that the Foundation's board approved an RFP for an audit of the Foundation's books extending back five years.

**8. Public Comment**

There were no comments from the public.

**9. End of Business Meeting**

With a motion (Satcher), second (Seckinger), and unanimous vote, Chair Hayes adjourned the meeting at 2:44 p.m.